DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 110 783 CE 004 596

AUTHOR Regan, Peter F.; And Others
TITLE Recurrent Education in the State of New York.
INSTITUTION Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, Paris (France). Centre for Educational Research and Innovation.
REPORT NO CERI/RE/72.02
PUB DATE 17 Jul 72
NOTE 40p.

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.76 HC-$1.95 Plus Postage
DESCRIPTORS Adult Education; Adult Education Programs; Community Colleges; *Educational Programs; *General Education; Higher Education; Post Secondary Education; *Professional Continuing Education; *Program Descriptions; *Technical Education
IDENTIFIERS New York; *Recurrent Education

ABSTRACT

The report on postsecondary education in New York State is a general survey of general education, technical education, and professional education programs in the State's postsecondary educational institutions. The report's introductory sections present current and projected statistics on numbers of colleges and students and discuss the basic educational programs and the standardized examinations used in establishing student proficiencies in certain academic areas. The discussion of general education programs covers the various programs, including a special baccalaureate program for adults, a weekend college program, a university without walls, and the Regent's External Degree Program, at eight New York postsecondary institutions. The survey of technical education reviews the technical programs in the State's community colleges, and agriculture and technical institutes, and the minimal offerings of the State's non-public junior colleges. The discussion of professional education describes various methods employed for maintaining professional knowledge and skill: the use of media, career ladders programs, preceptorship programs for intra-professional advancement, independent ventures, and organizational efforts toward coherent patterns. The report concludes with discussions of problems and policy considerations affecting adult education in New York State. (JR)

****
* Documents acquired by ERIC include many informal unpublished *
* materials not available from other sources. ERIC makes every effort *
* to obtain the best copy available. nevertheless, items of marginal *
* reproducibility are often encountered and this affects the quality *
* of the microfiche and hardcopy reproductions ERIC makes available *
* via the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). EDRS is not *
* responsible for the quality of the original document. Reproductions *
* supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made from the original. *
****

JUL 21 1975

SCOPE OF INTEREST NOTICE
The ERIC Facility has assigned this document for processing to: CE HE
In our judgement, this document is also of interest to the clearinghouses noted to the right. Indexing should reflect their special points of view.

ORGANISATION FOR ECONOMIC CO-OPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT

CENTRE FOR EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH AND INNOVATION

ED110783

RECURRENT EDUCATION

POLICY AND DEVELOPMENT IN OECD COUNTRIES

RECURRENT EDUCATION IN THE STATE OF NEW YORK

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

CE 004 596

ORGANISATION FOR ECONOMIC
CO-OPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT

Paris, 17th July, 1972

Centre for Educational Research
and Innovation

Or. Engl.

CERI/RE/72.02

RECURRENT EDUCATION

POLICY AND DEVELOPMENT IN OECD COUNTRIES

RECURRENT EDUCATION IN THE STATE OF NEW YORK

by

Peter F. REGAN

Norman SOLKOFF

Walter F. STAFFORD

(of the State University of New York)

CONTENTS

		Page
PREFACE		5
1.	INTRODUCTION	7
2.	POST-SECONDARY EDUCATION IN THE STATE OF NEW YORK	8
3.	RECURRENT EDUCATION IN THE STATE OF NEW YORK	10
4.	STANDARDIZED EXAMINATIONS	11
5.	GENERAL EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS	12
	5.1. The Main Features	12
	5.2. Example A - State University of New York at Buffalo, Millard Fillmore College	14
	5.3. Example B - City University of New York, Brooklyn College, School of General Studies	14
	5.4. Example C - New York University, Division of Liberal Studies	15
	5.5. Example D - Syracuse University	15
	5.6. Example E - State University College at Brockport, Bachelor of Arts in Liberal Studies	17
	5.7. Example F - Long Island University, C.W. Post Center, The Weekend College	18
	5.8. Example G - Skidmore College - The University Without Walls	19
	5.9. Example H - State University of New York, The Empire State College	20
	5.10. Example I - The Regents' External Degree Program	21
6.	TECHNOLOGIC EDUCATION	23
7.	PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION	26
	7.1. The Main Features	26
	7.2. Example A - The Use of Media	28
	7.3. Example B - Career Ladder Programs	29
	7.4. Example C - Preceptorship Programs for Intra-Professional Advancement	29

4

7.5. Example D - Independent Ventures 29

7.6. Example E - Organizational Efforts Towards Coherent Patterns 29

8. THE FUTURE OF RECURRENT EDUCATION IN THE STATE OF NEW YORK 31

9. PROBLEMS FACING RECURRENT EDUCATION 31

10. POLICY CONSIDERATIONS EFFECTING RECURRENT EDUCATION 33

11. SUMMARY 35

Annex: Bibliography and Personal Communications 37

PREFACE

This report is one of a series of six CERI documents on the state of recurrent education in OECD Member countries. Recurrent education, on which CERI has been carrying out preparatory work in the last few years, is rapidly becoming one of the most debated, but also one of the least clearly-defined, new concepts about the planning and organisation of education in modern society.

It has therefore been considered essential to endeavour to attach a precise meaning to what originated as an unstructured new concept and to spell out its structural and policy implications. As part of the project on recurrent education, for which Denis Kallen and Jarl Bengtsson carry the responsibility on the CERI staff side, CERI will in the near future publish a "Clarifying Report" which attempts to point out the essential characteristics of such a system and how it relates to the present sectors of post-compulsory and adult education.

At first sight it may appear to be giving the concept of "recurrent education" too wide an interpretation in applying it to the post-compulsory programmes of New York State which are reviewed in the report. Professor Regan and his co-authors have, however, selected with great care those programmes that allow adults to re-enter the post-compulsory system and that are potentially - and hopefully - the first elements of a generalised provision for an "in-and-out" pattern for post-compulsory education.

European readers are always fascinated by the American educational scene with its variety of ad hoc solutions, with its capacity to respond to new needs on the one hand and, on the other, its apparent unconcern for the maintenance of quality and for the occupational and broader socio-economic implications of educational novelties. Also in the USA, educational provisions for adults such as are described and commented on here are still a long way from recurrent education programmes in the proper sense. Some of these, however - and the report takes great care in judging each of the programmes on its merits - meet quite a number of the criteria as defined by the authors.

In the USA the idea that recurrent education could provide an alternative to the present "front-loading system of preparatory education"[1] is rapidly gaining ground. If such

---

1) The term is Warren Ziegler's, in a recent paper: "Recurrent Education: a Model for the Future of Adult Education and Learning in the United States", prepared for the Planning Group of the National Foundation for Post-Secondary Education, May 1972.

a change in course is ever taken, the ventures described in this report represent a solid basis of experience on which to build. Their interest for European countries is obvious: they show how post-compulsory institutions can meet the new demand for adult education and provide answers to at least some of the major questions, organisational and substantive, by which recurrent education is beset.

The other reports in the series concern France, the Federal Republic of Germany, Norway, Sweden and Yugoslavia.

1. INTRODUCTION

Post-secondary education in the State of New York faces an uncertain future. At this time, it is a large enterprise, and it has been an effective one. But it has had to double in size over the past ten years in an effort to keep pace with demand. Despite such growth, unmet needs are everywhere ... needs for more opportunities, needs for equality of opportunity, needs for improved relevance of teaching.

How will these needs be met?

If they are to be met by expansion of the conventional system of post-secondary education, the enterprise will have to double in size once more in the coming decade.

But such doubling of the conventional enterprise does not now appear likely. On the one hand, educational leaders are virtually unanimous in their predictions of revolutionary changes in the content and style of post-secondary education. They are joined on the other hand by economists and political leaders who indicate that the State cannot provide support for such a gargantuan expansion. There seems to be developing, therefore, a general climate of opinion calling for alternative modes of post-secondary education.

Recurrent education certainly represents one of these alternative modes. Within the State of New York, at this time, it presents a picture of considerable variety and vigor. There are signs, indeed, that it is entering a period of significant expansion.

In order properly to assess the status of recurrent education, however, two characteristics of the post-secondary educational system in the United States must be borne in mind.

The first of these characteristics is one of terminology. The term "recurrent education" is not commonly used in the United States. Programs of recurrent education are to be found under a wide variety of auspices and titles. Frequently, a single term, e.g. "adult education", is applied to programs some of which encompass all the elements of recurrent education, and some of which encompass none of those elements.

The second characteristic of the post-secondary educational system is its pluralism. Pluralism permeates the system, conferring on recurrent education efforts a richness of approach, but depriving them of the recognizeable impact that a more unified set of efforts would possess.

Bearing these characteristics in mind, this analysis will proceed through a brief examination of the context of post-secondary education in the State of New York, and then will focus on recurrent education within New York.

2. POST-SECONDARY EDUCATION IN THE STATE OF NEW YORK

The State of New York can serve as an adequate model for post-secondary education in the United States. With a population of 18.2 million citizens, New York contains approximately 9 per cent of the population of the United States. It embraces almost all ethnic groups, and contains a varied social structure which ranges from rural mountain communities through farmland, small cities and towns, and the metropolis of New York City with its suburbs (US Dept. of Commerce, 1971).

As regards post-secondary education, New York combines the various features of post-secondary education that might be found in differing parts of the United States. Under the aegis of the Board of Regents of the University of the State of New York (whose executive agency is the State Education Department), the citizens of New York are provided with a public system of post-secondary education (through the State University of New York and the City University of New York), as well as a system of private colleges and universities.

The scope and size of New York's post-secondary educational enterprise, like its population, comprise approximately 10 per cent of the post-secondary enterprise in the United States. In 1970, there were 212 public and private degree-granting institutions. They enrolled approximately 750,000 students, out of a total United States enrolment of 7.3 million students.

The State plays a key financial role in both the public and private systems of post-secondary education. It provides all direct operating support to 33 units of the State University of New York, 50 per cent of operating costs to the City University of New York, 33 to 40 per cent of operating costs to 37 Community Colleges, partial support to 60 qualifying private colleges and universities (through an aid program geared to the number and level of degrees granted during the preceding year), and direct support to students through scholarships, fellowships and scholar-incentive awards. In 1969, this support alone totaled $715.2 million; more support was provided through other channels such as special-purpose education, research and service funds, and through capital funding (Executive Budget, 1971). The total exceeded $1,000.0 million. The direct support is provided through three channels: 1) State University of New York, for its own units and community colleges; 2) City University of New York; 3) the State Education Department, for aid to non-public colleges and universities and for student support. It is also important to recognize that community colleges receive an additional 33 per cent or more of their funding from the city or county within which they function, and that the City University of New York receives the balance of its support from the City of New York. While the State plays a key financial role, therefore, the system as a whole is funded through a variety of mechanisms and authorities.

The post-secondary educational system in New York also serves as a good model for studying the problems that now beset the whole of United States' post-secondary system. Indeed, it is more advanced than other states, in terms of the problem of increasing numbers of secondary school graduates, and increasing proportions of such graduates who desire entry into post-secondary degree programs. As illustrated in Table 1, the number of secondary school graduates is rising sharply and the percentage of such graduates who proceed into post-secondary degree programs has risen from 50 per cent to 80 per cent within the past ten years; if present trends continue, it is expected to rise to almost 90 per cent in the next ten years. The consequence of these phenomena is an increasing pressure for admission into post-secondary institutions which, if satisfied, would require that the capacities of the institutions would almost double within the next ten years.

Table 1

State of New York

Secondary School Graduates and Post-Secondary Enrolments

(State University of New York, 1970)

Academic Year	Number of Secondary School Graduates	Percentage of Secondary School Graduates Enroling in Post-Secondary Degree Programs	Number of Full-Time Enrolments in Post-Secondary Degree Programs	Number of Part-Time Enrolments in Post-Secondary Degree Programs
1959-60	164,000	50%	214,000	120,000 (est.)
1969-70	238,900	80%	496,500	270,000 (est.)
1979-80	289,000 (est.)	88% (est.)	759,000 (est.)	400,000 (est.)

At present, there is no formalized overall strategy for dealing with these problems. To a large extent, however, planners and administrators appear to be pursuing many of the strategies proposed by two influential national studies (Carnegie Commission, 1971; Newman, 1971). In each of these reports, the pervasive emphasis rests on a restructuring of the present system of post-secondary education by a variety of techniques, e.g. abbreviated curricula, specialized institutions, reorganization of state systems of higher education, and a new hierarchy of degrees. Both of the reports, however, also advocate the development of a system of post-secondary education which allows for entry and exit periodically throughout a person's life-span. The arguments put forth in favor of such an "in and out pattern" include the need for more

equality of opportunity among age groups, as well as between different socio-economic segments of each age group; ending the segregation of a "student caste"; and the inherent value of life experience and adult motivation in the learning process. A similar emphasis may be found with respect to medical and dental education in a previous Carnegie Commission Report (1970).

While the advocacy of an "in and out pattern" is not new (e.g. Dryer, 1962; Joint Advisory Committee, 1965; Gardner, 1965), there is evidence that a more effective response is now being generated, as we shall see below. It must be remembered, however, that the planning and administrative emphasis tends to be focused on the large mass of the conventional enterprise, with its problem of numbers, facilities, governance, collective bargaining, etc.

3. RECURRENT EDUCATION IN THE STATE OF NEW YORK

An assessment of the present status of recurrent education in New York State must depend upon approximations. There simply is no comprehensive data base. In dealing with overall figures, therefore, it is necessary to combine several approaches: calculations based on findings like those of Johnstone (1965), the estimates of experts, and the experience of the leading institutional programs. With respect to quality and style of education, typical examples of programs now in operation can give a sufficient (though admittedly incomplete) picture of the efforts now being carried out.

These approximations are necessary for a reason which will be considered in more detail later in this paper. Briefly, the most important reason for obscurity about the status of recurrent education is the fact that the data-gathering apparatus in the United States has focused on institutional enrolments of the "college age" population. Adult enrolments are interwoven with those figures, and special attention has not been dedicated to the quantitative or qualitative aspects of such enrolments. With the entire sphere of "adult education" thus merged with institutional totals, precise measurements of recurrent education become extremely difficult.

Within these constraints, qualitative and quantitative assessments may be obtained in three broad areas of recurrent education: general education, technologic education and professional education. In each of these areas, there are varied approaches to recurrent education, and equally varied differences in terminology. As we review the three broad areas, therefore, an attempt will be made to clarify the extent to which they constitute a complete program of recurrent education. For purposes of this assessment, the following elements are considered to be essential if a program is to be recognized as being truly recurrent education:

1. Entry into post-secondary education at any time following the completion of the compulsory age of secondary schooling.

2. Curricular design and teaching methodology designed cooperatively by students and faculty, and adapted to the interests, accomplishments, and motivations of different age groups and social class groups.

3. Sufficient flexibility in location and time arrangements that the program is truly available to citizens pursuing careers.

4. Utilization of appropriate life experience as equivalent to formal course work of a conventional sort.

5. Opportunity to pursue educational objectives in an intermittent fashion.

6. Public acceptance of the degrees or certificates offered by the program.

As will be seen, few of the programs to be described possess all of these basic elements. Each program, however, possesses one or more of the elements, and greater cross-utilization of these elements appears to be underway.

4. STANDARDIZED EXAMINATIONS

One additional factor needs consideration at this point. It is clear that all of the systems that will be described are dependent upon the accumulation of credits that are the equivalent of 120 semester hours obtained in conventional post-secondary educational experience in the United States. "Credit" and "equivalency" are essential in this process, and it is therefore obvious that some means of external testing must be developed and receive wide acceptance both by the public and by institutions of higher education.

At this time, the picture of recurrent education in the State of New York is influenced by two major developments in the field of external testing. These are the College Level Examination Program of the College Entrance Examination Board and the College Proficiency Examination Program of the New York State Education Department.

The College Level Examination Program (CLEP)

The College Level Examination Program was organized by the College Entrance Examination Board, a nationally recognized institution, in 1965. Since that time, it has developed college level examinations in the areas of English, natural sciences, mathematics, humanities, and social sciences-history. These have been given in every state of the nation, and are accepted for credit by most institutions of higher education...albeit the extent to which they are accepted as credit toward degrees will vary from institution to institution, and from department to department within institutions. The CLEP Program has conducted many experiments in independent study, involving rural areas and collaboration with such institutions as public libraries and Junior Colleges (College Board, 1971). At this time, the examinations are comprehensive within the

areas named above, with subdivisions for the different disciplines within each area. The examinations themselves are not now intended to constitute a curriculum. They can, nonetheless, qualify people for entry into advanced stages of post-secondary education in most areas of the United States.

College Proficiency Examination Program (CPEP)

The New York State Education Department has been developing an active program of external examination since 1963. At that time, there was established the College Proficiency Examination Program (CPEP), designed to enable individuals to obtain college credit by means of examination, without the necessity of formal classroom preparation. Examinations currently involve 25 subjects, and follow varying formats: multiple choice, essay, or problem-solving. The examinations are prepared and graded by faculty members from colleges and universities in New York, and cover four principal areas: nursing sciences, foreign languages, teacher education, and arts and sciences. Between 1963 and 1971, more than 17,000 tests were taken, and the number is rising each year.

These examinations provide an objective evaluation of the student's relative proficiency in the subject area of the examination, and the results may be accepted as credits toward a degree by 212 universities and colleges in the State of New York. It is important to note, however, that the acceptance of a satisfactory score on the examination is dependent upon the decision of each individual college or university, and this decision varies considerably with the attitude of departments and professional programs, as well as with general regulations of the specific institution. In all cases, the degree or certificate that the student receives is granted by the institution and not by the State Education Department (Nolan, 1971).

5. GENERAL EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS

5.1. The Main Features

General educational programs are those that provide opportunities leading to a general baccalaureate degree, usually considered to involve study in each of three areas: humanities, social science and natural science. In conventional colleges and universities, obtaining such a degree takes four years and requires the completion of 120 or more semester hours of work (or the equivalent in special programs or independent study). The same standards are adhered to by programs geared to recurrent education and to the education of adults. In view of the fact that there are approximately 270,000 part-time students in the degree-granting post-secondary system in New York State, the estimates of Newman (1971) (which suggest that one-third of part-time students are adult), and the estimates of Spengler (1971) (which suggest that there are 40,000 such students in New York City alone), lead to the current estimate that there are approximately 100,000 adults pursuing such an education on a part-time basis.

As we shall see, most adult students seeking a baccalaureate degree on a part-time basis are in fact being provided with an opportunity to partake of more or less conventional post-secondary education. More than 90 per cent of intermittent adult education is conducted by conventional educational institutions that provide courses almost identical with those that are offered to full-time secondary school leavers, but provide them to the adult population in so-called "evening sessions". In terms of the essential elements for recurrent education, the bulk of these programs satisfy only one or two of the criteria: thus,

1. Such programs usually require a graduation certificate from secondary education.

2. The curricular design and teaching methodology involve the usual classroom and laboratory experiences provided to secondary school leavers, and are conducted on the campuses of the parent universities.

3. Most of the programs are conducted in urban areas by urban universities, and are conducted at night. Therefore, they can be reached by a large portion of the population residing in the cities but are unavailable to students from rural areas or to those students who cannot attend evening sessions.

4. In each program, there is a degree of acceptance of life experience as equivalent to formal course work, but this is usually an exception rather than a rule within each program.

5. Each of these programs allows opportunity for entry and exit from the educational pattern, so that a baccalaureate can be pursued in an intermittent fashion. However, the requirements for a baccalaureate degree are those set for full-time students and may change from time to time; a part-time student may have to revise his entire program as various requirements are altered for full-time students.

6. Degrees provided by this mechanism are recognized publicly as equivalent to baccalaureate degrees achieved in conventional education.

Within the framework of these major programs, there has developed an increasing tendency toward more flexible, innovative, and interdisciplinary means of instruction which appear much more congruent with the concepts of recurrent education. Indeed, many of these programs are beginning to have greater appeal to secondary school leavers than the more conventional programs offered to full-time secondary school leavers. Four large programs operating in the State of New York have followed different patterns for the introduction of innovation, and are cited below.

5.2. Example A - State University of New York at Buffalo, Millard Fillmore College

This unit of the State University of New York at Buffalo was established in 1923, by then Chancellor Samuel P. Capen, specifically to provide educational opportunities for citizens 22 years of age or older. In 1969-70, 4,964 students were enrolled on a part-time basis. Of those enrolled, more than 50 per cent were over the age of 25. Opportunities for entry and exit are at the beginning and end of each semester, and approximately 50 per cent of those enrolled eventually obtain a two year (Associate) degree, or a four year (Bachelors) degree. 90 per cent of the students, youthful and adult alike, pursue an educational program consisting of courses identical or nearly identical with those offered to full-time day students who enter the University immediately upon completion of their secondary education. Such courses are undoubtedly appropriate for some portion of the 90 per cent, but it is unfortunate that only 10 per cent of the students can take advantage of opportunities for independent study, specifically designed interdisciplinary programs geared to life interest, or specially designed seminar programs. The Millard Fillmore College offers an advisory program to guide students toward curricula most suited for themselves, but several constraints impose severe limitation on the student's opportunities. The use of qualifying examinations (such as the College Entrance Examination Board's College Level Examination Program and New York's College Proficiency Examination Program) to provide credit for life experience can only be made available with approval from the university's departments. Similarly, the use of special seminars and independent study is sharply restricted by the fact that the Millard Fillmore College itself cannot grant the degree, but must seek approval from the university departments. Courses are provided mostly during the evening hours, and on the university campus; this latter limitation is not excessively detrimental, as the university campus is centrally located within a metropolitan area of 1.5 million people (Berner, 1971).

5.3. Example B - City University of New York, Brooklyn College School of General Studies

The School of General Studies was established at Brooklyn College in 1950 in order to accommodate the needs of adult students desirous of pursuing a baccalaureate degree in the evening hours. At present, 8,000 students are enrolled in this program; in 1968, 600 students received degrees as a result of their study in the program. The bulk of students enrolled in this program are pursuing relatively conventional courses, provided on the university campus during evening hours.

Two hundred students, however, are involved in the "Special Baccalaureate Degree Program for Adults" which (a) grants credit on the basis of students' past experience in various professional and business roles, (b) provides a program of general education consisting of semester-long "seminars" (of five hours per week of classroom work plus home study) and (c) uses interdisciplinary approaches and team instruction in dealing with the natural sciences social sciences, communication skills and humanities. An additional 400 students are enrolled in the "Small College Program" which

pursues the same general objectives as the Special Baccalaureate Degree Program for Adults, but additionally is geared to socially and economically disadvantaged students (who get remedial work in such areas as english and mathematics) and is strongly dependent upon recruitment by community leaders. The first of these special programs has received funding from foundations, while the second has received funding from a number of Federal programs for the disadvantaged, as well as from grants by private agencies and the State of New York (Spengler, 1971; Jacobson, 1970).

5.4. Example C - New York University, Division of Liberal Studies

One of the largest universities in the United States, New York University conducts an extensive program in continuing education, annually registering as many as 40,000 students, the bulk of whom are pursuing non-credit courses of a widely varied nature. 9,200 students are involved in the Division of Liberal Studies which offers credit courses leading to an associate or bachelors degree. While many courses are conventional, there is a continual emphasis on the development of topical and interdisciplinary courses which will generate "excitement" through their content (e.g. History of Black America, China Today, etc.) and which rely heavily upon the resources of the city (e.g. museums, opera, etc.). This program enrols students ranging from the teens to old age, some of whom have already obtained degrees in a conventional fashion. 75 per cent of the students have had one or more years of college, and the group as a whole has an income level above the median for New York City's population. Most of the students in this program are not involved in a coherent sequence leading toward a degree, but move in and out as their interests dictate. In addition, 250 students are engaged in a coherent eight-semester program, leading to the Associate in Arts degree, and 250 take part in a coherent degree program aimed at an Associate degree in Applied Science and Business. Almost half of these students are from socially and economically disadvantaged groups (Smith, 1971).

5.5. Example D - Syracuse University

With a long history of efforts in continuing education, Syracuse University now offers a full-credit "evening college", with 300 course offerings each semester, and a total annual enrolment of approximately 6,000 students. The bulk of these offerings are conventional courses as offered within the usual university setting, and are taken by students working in the Syracuse area. In addition, a Bachelors degree in Liberal Studies has been offered since 1966, with help from a Carnegie Foundation grant. In this program, four content areas (humanities, social sciences, physical sciences and mathematics) are offered in an interdisciplinary fashion, with advanced standing being granted upon the basis of the applicant's past experiences, and achievement on College Level Entrance Program examinations. The program currently involves approximately 150 students, with future plans to increase to a maximum of approximately 200. It is conducted by interdisciplinary faculty committees, and the learning process involves seminars, life experience, independent study and independent projects conducted under faculty guidance. Only 24 days of residence on campus

is required, and extensive use is made of tutorial work by means of telephone and correspondence between faculty members and the students. Costs to the student approximate $1,500 per year, with additional fees for conventional learning, etc. (Funk, 1971).

These four examples constitute one end of a spectrum of recurrent education. They are large; they are urban; more than 90 per cent of their offerings are drawn from conventional offerings to young full-time students; acquisition of a degree by a student depends upon the decision of the institutions' disciplinary departments. In some ways, it could be said that most of their efforts for adults consist of offering day-time courses in the evening hours.

But there are more similarities. Each of these programs actually contributes to the financial security of the institution's day-time program by virtue of maintaining a low instructional cost; such a pattern results in either a direct financial contribution from fees collected (in non-public institutions), or an indirect contribution by increasing the institutions' support via enrolment figures (in public institutions).

In each of the programs, the educators are enthusiastic about the motivation, initiative, and capacity of the working students. Moreover, they are keenly desirous of developing special programs geared to those special characteristics, but have been able to do so for only 10 per cent or less of the student body. Two factors seem to hold them back: 1) constraints imposed by the "day-oriented" faculty, and 2) the costs of such programs. With respect to the latter point, it is significant that each of the specially-designed programs has been initiated with some kind of special funding from outside the institution.

In sum, it must be recognized that large "evening programs" such as these are in fact making a form of recurrent education available, albeit they face considerable difficulty.

As we proceed further along the spectrum of recurrent education, we begin to encounter programs designed in a fashion more specifically congruent with the elements of recurrent education. In respect to these elements, the next group of programs achieves the following:

1. Each of the programs allows for entry at any time following completion of the period of the age of compulsory education, dependent upon testing for ability.

2. In each case, the curricular design and teaching methodology are adapted to the interests, accomplishments and motivations of different age groups and different student groups, and also to the principles of intermittent learning.

3. While each of the programs has a geographic center of activity, and all but one of the programs requires geographic attendance on a campus, this geographic dependency is sharply circumscribed in time. The time arrangements and geographic arrangements are very largely adapted to limitations imposed on students by their pursuit of life patterns of work.

4. Each program accepts life experiences in a suitable fashion, usually dependent upon the use of qualifying examinations.

5. Each of the programs lacks a sufficient duration of experience to determine whether or not the degrees will obtain public and educational acceptability.

The programs to be considered under this category are the following:

5.6. Example E - State University College at Brockport, Bachelor of Arts in Liberal Studies

Authorized by the State University of New York and the State Education Department in 1970, this program began operation in the summer of 1971. Substantially, it consists of a program specifically designed for adults, involving several steps (Catalogue, 1971-72):

1. Comprehensive Examinations. Following application, students are required to take all examinations of the College Entrance Examination Board's College Level Examination Program, and it is recommended that they also take several of the New York College Proficiency Examinations.

2. Enrolment Seminar. Students who are being considered for acceptance to the program spend two days on the college campus. In consultation with faculty advisors they are provided with credit on the basis of results in their examinations, previous courses which they have taken in post-secondary education, and their life experience. Following recognition of these assets, the student and faculty advisors establish a time-table and curricular plan designed to bring the student to the completion of a Bachelor of Arts degree at his own pace and time.

3. Area Study Programs. Each student must engage in an individually designed period of independent study (which may consist of reading, formal courses at any accredited institution of higher education, correspondence courses, or courses by examination) followed by a three-week seminar conducted on the campus at Brockport, and the completion of a suitable project. Such a sequence must be followed in each of three general academic areas: social sciences, natural sciences and humanities.

4. Integration Study. After satisfactory completion of the three Area Study Programs, the pattern of individual study, seminar and project (again requiring three weeks full campus participation) is dedicated to an Integrating Area Study Program. In this the student is expected to complete a project bringing together the strengths of a number of disciplines on a particular problem area of individual concern.

This program is conducted by the full-time faculty of the State University College at Brockport, but has authorization to grant its own degrees. Some seminars are given on weekends rather than in three successive weeks. The use of mass media is limited, except insofar as the student may choose to use courses distributed by correspondence, radio or television. The curriculum content is specifically designed for the individual student, with emphasis on the utilization of life experiences.

Costs to the student are relatively low. They include $85.00 for application, examinations, and enrolment seminar, and $174.15 for each of the four subsequent seminars. Additional fees may be charged for testing, reading lists or conventional study.

Although this program has a short history, 250 students are already enrolled and actively engaged in the program, six seminars have already been completed, and enrolment will exceed 450 by June, 1972 (approximately 18 months after authorization was received) (Johnston, 1971).

5.7. Example F - Long Island University, C.W. Post Center, The Weekend College

Established in 1971, the Weekend College is specifically geared to providing appropriate education to adults, based on the principle of concentrated learning experience. The format for the Weekend College is one which provides an adult student with the opportunity to take single, three-semester hour courses, in one of two ways:

1. Six hours of seminar and classroom activity on the C.W. Post Center Campus on each of six successive weekends, with independent study in the intervals between campus sessions.

2. Fourteen hours of seminar and classroom work on the C.W. Post Center Campus, on each of two weekends, one month apart, with independent study in the interval between.

Up to thirty hours of college credit may be obtained by the use of the College Level Examination Program or the College Proficiency Examination Program. Most of the course offerings are drawn from the standard curriculum of the C.W. Post Center, and therefore follow traditional disciplinary and content lines. A few courses, presently in the developmental state, aim at increased interdisciplinarity, relevance to the concerns of an adult, and utilization of life experience. All courses, clearly, are dependent upon the effectiveness of concentrated and intensive experience with a single course, as contrasted with the tradition pattern of engaging in several different courses simultaneously.

This program is adapted to the time needs and financial needs of adults, and undoubtedly draws benefits from the intensity of the group experience associated with the learning process. While there is no geographic distribution, the C.W. Post Center is located in a populous area on Long Island, within easy commuting distance

of more than one million people; in addition, most of the course work can be done through independent effort in the home situation. Due to the concentrated nature of courses, the financial obligations of the students can be adjusted by varying the frequency with which courses are taken; additionally, the students may use credit cards for deferred payment plans. An incentive for adult participation is provided by establishing reduced tuition rates, if more than one adult in the family is engaged in a course.

In its first semester of operation (Fall 1971), the Weekend College enrolled 241 students in 16 courses. 90 per cent of the students were adult, and 12 per cent used a deferred payment plan. (Lauper, 1971; Kaplowitz, 1971).

5.8. Example G - Skidmore College - The University Without Walls

The University Without Walls (UWW) was founded by the Union of Experimental Colleges and Universities, a group of twenty private and public institutions located in a number of states. It presently enrols approximately one thousand students in its various programs. Skidmore College, a non-public liberal arts institution located in New York, is a charter member of this group, and its UWW Program presently enrols 115 students ranging in age from 17 to 58 years.

The academic program for each student is developed by the student and a faculty advisor, with the approval of a Student--Faculty Committee. The program is designed to meet the student's needs and time requirements, and it generally involves independent study with short periods of attendance on the campus. The time required for completion of a baccalaureate program is individually arranged.

Regarding the baccalaureate degree, the student may receive one of two types: a UWW degree awarded by the Union of Experimental Colleges and Universities (headquartered at Antioch College in Ohio) or a combined UWW--Skidmore College Degree. The latter degree requires complete adherence to the relatively rigid Skidmore College requirements. It is anticipated that twelve degrees will be awarded in this program by June, 1972; six of these will be combined UWW--Skidmore degrees and six will be UWW degrees.

Initial funding for this program has been derived from the Ford Foundation and the Federal Government with some experimental grants. The cost to students is approximately $2,300 for a full-load calendar year (Palamountain, 1971; Gelber, 1971).

Each of these three programs introduces elements not found in earlier examples. While small, they all have a foundation based on the value of life experience. They are geared to educational pursuits in an intermittent fashion, and at a pace suitable to the student's objectives. Significantly, they are not exclusively adult-oriented, each being capable of dealing with youthful and adult students in an appropriate manner.

On the other hand, each of these examples shares some of the characteristics found in the first four examples. The most important of these is their dependence upon their sponsoring institution for academic legitimacy. In the Brockport Program and in the Weekend College, obtaining the baccalaureate degree depends upon the verification of the conventional faculty. At Skidmore, it is necessary to note that a "University Without Walls" degree is not a Skidmore College degree; the latter can be obtained only by satisfying all of the usual requirements (including prerequisites, a major and a year in residence).

A second feature reminiscent of the first four examples is a financial one. Each of these three programs seems to offer a less expensive learning vehicle to the student...and indeed they do, but only if the student does not engage in conventional learning programs. To the extent that the student requires regular forms of instruction, indeed, the Brockport and Skidmore programs actually impose a surcharge.

Even with these problems, each of the programs is innovative, with a definite thrust toward recurrent education.

At this point, it is possible to consider two new programs which are at that end of the educational spectrum most congruent with the concepts of recurrent education. Both of these programs are in early stages of development, but they carry the institutional commitments of two of the most influential educational organizations in the State, and therefore are extremely significant.

5.9. Example H - State University of New York, The Empire State College

The Empire State College, authorized by the Board of Trustees of the State University of New York in 1971, is an independent unit of the State University, having its own degree-granting capability, and dedicated to providing students with the means of achieving individually designed programs, through appropriate mixtures of teaching and learning techniques. The headquarters of the Empire State College is located in Saratoga Springs, and the program is now in its developmental phase, partially supported by a joint grant from the Carnegie Foundation and the Ford Foundation.

It is intended that the Empire State College operate in a flexible academic mode. Thus, the college itself will maintain its own faculty which will have primary responsibility in three areas:

1. The development of course materials which can be provided to students everywhere in the State of New York by means of correspondence, radio, television, and programmed instruction.

2. Supervision of students by means of "mentors" stationed in Learning Centers scattered throughout the State. At Learning Centers, students will be provided with the opportunity to receive academic credit for life experience, independent study, and courses taken by examination. In addition, they will have the opportunity for learning experiences in small groups, and will be given advisement with respect to courses that might appropriately be taken at any of the public or private institutions of post-secondary education in the State.

3. Review of the total curriculum completed by the student, followed by awarding of the appropriate associate or baccalaureate degree, if the curriculum is appropriate (Hall, James-1971; Hall, John-1971).

At present, the Empire State College can utilize the correspondence programs and "University of the Air" programs previously managed by the State University of New York's central office, and is in the process of establishing the geographically-distributed Learning Centers. It is anticipated that students of any age, from any part of the State of New York, may enrol in the Empire State College. They may then proceed toward the achievement of a degree at their own pace, accumulating credit for courses taken in conventional institutions or through mass media techniques, and for projects in independent study approved by faculty mentors.

Still in its developmental stage, the Empire State College presently has more than 120 students enrolled and is operating Learning Centers in two geographic locations in the State of New York. Eight Learning Centers are anticipated in the future.

This enterprise will obviously be compelled to lean heavily on external examinations developed by the College Level Examination Program and the College Proficiency Examination Program. As a part of the post-secondary system of the State University of New York, it will be able to tap the resources of the State University's 70 campuses located throughout the State, thereby providing maximum geographic distribution. To the extent that mass media are utilized, the program can extend into virtually every home in the State and in an effective fashion. It is intended that the programs encompass a degree of interdisciplinarity and relevance to life experience that will be suitable for students of every age group. The linkage between this system and the conventional enterprises of the State University may well contribute to a new formulation of post-secondary education.

5.10. Example I - The Regents' External Degree Program

This program was announced by the Chancellor of the University of the State of New York in the fall of 1970. It is intended to function as a full-fledged external degree program, operating under the direct authority of the Board of Regents. Essentially, the program consists of an extension of the State Education Department's previous experience with the College Proficiency Examination Program (vide supra), with two significant modifications:

1. The Examination Program will embrace the totality of subjects necessary for obtaining a degree, and the testing format will be designed in a manner appropriate to each subject (so that some subjects may be tested by the multiple-choice format, some by written examination, some by oral examination, some by submission of a thesis or project).

2. By virtue of satisfactory performance on a sequence of examinations, and with the endorsement of faculty who have participated in the development of examinations, the State Education Department (acting on behalf of the University of the State of New York) will itself grant the degree. It will therefore constitute a uniform standard throughout the State of New York, and student achievements on the examination program will not be subject to varying interpretations at different institutions, as is the present situation.

It must be emphasized that the Regents' External Degree Program of the State Education Department does not preclude the participation by a student in formal educational activities, whether in a conventional institution of higher education, or through correspondence, radio, television, or other learning patterns. In point of fact, the program involves the establishment of a Home-Study Clearinghouse, responsible for providing the student with an analysis of appropriate correspondence courses, programmed texts, study guides, and the like, as well as the provision of a selective bibliography for the subject areas in which the student intends to take the examination.

Although the student may therefore use conventional means of learning in order to sit for the examinations, he is not compelled to do so, and it is theoretically possible to achieve a degree without ever having pursued classical learning techniques.

This program, announced in 1970, is now proceeding through a three-year developmental phase, partially supported by a joint grant from the Ford Foundation and the Carnegie Foundation. It is anticipated that it may be possible to offer an associate degree as early as 1972 and a bachelors degree by late 1973.

This program has obvious significance to all educational programs geared to recurrent education. It provides a uniform statewide method of evaluating proficiency, implements the concept of geographic distribution, allows for assessment of the value of life experience and independent study, and allows the student to establish a time table and a course sequence best suited to his life career (Nolan, 1971).

With these two examples, we reach that end of the spectrum most propitious for recurrent education. Each of these programs offers the student, young or old, maximum opportunity to pursue a learning sequence most suited to his abilities and objectives. Each recognizes the academic value of life experience. Each allows the opportunity for any type of admixture of study techniques. Finally, each operates under an impressive aegis: the Empire State College under the banner of the State University of New York, the nation's largest single system of post-secondary education; the Regents' External Degree Program, an authorization of the State's highest, constitutionally-designated, educational authority.

It would be unfortunate, however, if it were not recognized that both of these major ventures are now in very early stages of development. The Empire State College, at this time, is dealing with fewer than 125 students, and does not yet operate the kind of large-scale program that can make it a powerful and economically-feasible learning resource for the citizens of the State. Similarly, the Regents' External Degree Program has not yet developed a single complete degree sequence, so that its promise has yet to be tested, in terms of effectiveness, public acceptance, and academic validity.

But it is too early to expect more from either program. The United Kingdom's Open University required six years to grow to the level of being able to accommodate 25,000 students, and neither of these programs has yet completed 18 months of activity. What is perhaps most significant for recurrent education is that the two programs involve major commitments by two of the most powerful agencies in the State (The State Education Department and the State University of New York) and that they are funded by two of the nations most respected foundations (the Ford Foundation and the Carnegie Foundation).

6. TECHNOLOGIC EDUCATION

Some elements of technologic education may be found in almost every segment of the post-secondary educational enterprise. In most instances, however, adequate study is difficult: technologic education conducted within businesses and government agencies is generally aimed at specific jobs within those institutions, and does not carry transferable credit; technologic education conducted by colleges and universities is embedded in baccalaureate programs, where the technologic elements are restricted to a minor and frequently ambiguous role.

In consequence, the best opportunity for assessing recurrent patterns in technologic education is to be found in a study of short-cycle institutions, of which New York contains three categories: Community Colleges, Agricultural and Technical Institutes, and non-public Junior Colleges.

Community Colleges. The 37 Community Colleges in the State of New York receive more than 60 per cent of their funding from tax support (divided between State support and support from the County in which the Community College operates) and the remainder from student tuition. State funds are derived under the aegis of the State University of New York, and overall management is jointly controlled by the State University on the one hand, and by the County government or the City University of New York, on the other hand. In 1970, a total of 165,684 students were enrolled in these institutions, with approximately 50 per cent of the students following technologic programs leading to the Associate in Applied Sciences (AAS) degree and 50 per cent of the students pursuing general education leading to the Associate in Arts (AA) degree (which can be used for transfer to more advanced programs in the State's colleges and universities).

The Community Colleges are under a state-wide mandate to dedicate approximately 50 per cent of their teaching efforts toward the technologic fields, and to do so in the light of local employment needs. The

roster of programs offered is therefore very diverse, including hundreds of subjects ranging from electrical technology through dental assistant technology to fashion-apparel design. It is possible for a student to attain proficiency in the technologic area without completing all the requirements for an associate degree, in which case the student receives a certificate testifying to this proficiency.

Entry into the technologic programs of Community Colleges is open to all citizens of any age, and a high school diploma or its equivalent is required only if it is deemed necessary for satisfactory study in the technologic area which the student wishes to pursue.

Agricultural and Technical Institutes. There are six such institutes, located in various geographic areas of the State and operated directly by the State University of New York. They conduct two-year programs leading to the AAS degree. Having been founded with an agricultural emphasis, they have retained that function, but have also taken up the type of locally-determined technologic subjects described for the Community Colleges. Almost all of the 23,234 students enrolled in the Agricultural and Technical Institutes in 1970 were pursuing technologic courses.

Non-Public Two-Year Colleges. Under sponsorship of voluntary or religious organizations, a number of two-year colleges function under a variety of names ("Community College", "Junior College", "College"). For the most part, these institutions aim to provide a student with educational opportunities related to the first two years of a baccalaureate program, with far less emphasis on the technologic area than is provided by public Community Colleges.

In the end, therefore, we are left with the Community Colleges and the Agricultural and Technical Institutes as vehicles for technologic education. In 1969, these 43 institutions (many of which have multiple locations) enrolled 188,918 students, 50 per cent of whom were in technologic programs. More pertinent to the issue of recurrent education, however, is the fact that they enrolled 4,177 part-time students in diploma and certificate programs and 14,939 part-time students in technologic degree programs. Almost all of these students were adults (see Table 2).

The Community Colleges and Agricultural and Technical Institutes, therefore, satisfy many of the requirements of recurrent education, insofar as technologic education is concerned. Thus,

1. They allow entry into the post-secondary system at any time following the completion of the compulsory school age.

2. The curricular design and methodology in the technologic areas are adapted to interests and specific career objectives of students, and are related to the economic characteristics of the region in which they operate.

3. Geographic distribution is adequate, with State-wide coverage.

Table 2

State of New York

Part-Time Enrolments by Area

at

Community Colleges and Agricultural and Technical Institutes

Fall 1970

(State University of New York, 1971)

Area of Study	Diploma and Certificate Programs	AAS Degree Programs
Applied Arts	3	1,387
Architecture and related professions	211	53
Business	994	6,537
Engineering, applied sciences and technologies	2,491	2,910
Health sciences, professions and technologies	239	2,060
Liberal arts and general studies	98	
Public services and professions	60	1,918
Other fields	81	74
TOTAL	4,177	14,939

4. Acceptance of life experience for academic credit is minimal, but the programs are of a short-cycle nature, and this does not impose severe hardship on students.

5. The student is allowed opportunity to pursue educational objectives in an intermittent pattern, and indeed many students seek educational programs from the Community Colleges on repeated occasions.

6. General acceptance of this technologic education is relatively high, varying according to the quality of the institution.

In contrast to their contribution to recurrent education in the technologic area, the short-cycle institutions perform a relatively standard role in general education leading to the Associate in Arts degree. These programs (which qualify for transfer to four-year colleges and universities) are filled with enrolments of secondary school leavers, and it is difficult for the adult to gain entry. There is pressure, indeed, for the Community Colleges to serve as entry points for youthful enrolments in colleges and universities (Martorana, 1971).

7. PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION

7.1. The Main Features

It must be recognized from the outset that recurrent education is not strong in the professional fields. It is possible to distinguish exceptions to this general rule, and an individualized style of recurrent education appears to be developing within the field of medicine. For the most part, however, professional education in the State of New York is geared to provide opportunity to the young student in preference to the older student, and it is a lengthy process aimed at preparing a "finished product".

There are two basic reasons for this state of affairs, one related to the general context of education, and one to the special social pressures on the professions:

1. Professional education is almost completely integrated into the university-based higher educational system, in contrast to the separate status it holds in many other nations. While there are some exceptions (e.g. hospital-based schools of nursing), the professional schools operate either at the baccalaureate or graduate level, and grant university degrees at these levels. Professional schools at the baccalaureate level are therefore subject to the same pressure for admission from secondary school leavers as are the general education programs, independent of manpower needs or student desire. Professional schools at the graduate level, meanwhile, draw their entering classes almost entirely from baccalaureate programs, so that almost all entering students are in the 20-23 year age group. The older candidate for entry at either level is at a distinct numerical and social disadvantage in a youth-oriented society.

2. In most professions, the pressure for admission by young people is rendered more powerful by the high cost of professional education and the shortage of professional practitioners. Thus, there is a distinct bias against allowing an older student to enter a profession such as medicine, because his years of rendering professional service would be presumably fewer than those rendered by a younger applicant.

As a result of this set of circumstances, the number of opportunities for older people seeking entry into the professions has been diminishing rather than increasing over the past thirty years. Prior to and immediately after World War II, opportunities for entering law, engineering, social welfare and education were abundant for the middle-aged person; at the present time, they are extremely limited.

The pattern of early entry into professional life has now been predominant for twenty years. Practitioners in the various professions have therefore been confronted with serious difficulties in finding means of maintaining their knowledge and skills in the face of rapid obsolescence, and in advancing themselves inside the profession in which they are engaged.

In order to satisfy the needs for maintenance and advancement, professional schools and other organizations have had to develop techniques more or less independent of the formal instructional system. This development was necessary because of the fact that the formal instructional system has been filled with the young learners, and because the financing of professional schools and formal education has been focused almost entirely on those students.

The professions, therefore, have developed a pattern of "continuing education", the main objective of which has been maintenance of knowledge and skills while advancement within the profession has been a relatively limited objective. Several common elements appear in this pattern of "continuing education", across the several professions:

1. Continuing education programs are generally discrete entities, with a duration ranging from one hour to a week, the average duration being one to three days.

2. Most frequently, the content of a particular program will be on a specific issue, e.g. "Hyperbaric Medicine", "Nursing Practices in Intensive Care Units", "New York Matrimony Law". A few Programs are geared to a more comprehensive review of "recent developments".

3. Faculty for programs are drawn together specifically for the program in question, and may include faculty from professional schools as well as outstanding practitioners.

4. Sponsorship for programs is generally found in one of two areas: professional schools organizing programs through "offices of continuing education"; professional specialty societies, organizing programs desired by their memberships.

5. Financing of such programs depends almost entirely upon fees paid by the attendees.

6. Such programs are sometimes conducted in the facilities of professional schools; many of them are conducted in public facilities such as hotels; a few are conducted within working settings, e.g. hospitals, clinics, etc.

7. Attendance at such programs has been voluntary for the most part. Studies have indicated that most attendees are drawn from a minority of practitioners and there are some suggestions that this minority is probably the group least in need of pursuing programs to maintain their knowledge and skill (Clute, 1963; Lewis, 1970; Youmans, 1935).

It is evident that a pattern of this nature lacks cohesion, does not have a standardized curricular format, has a very high variation in the caliber of programs produced, and cannot assure those who take part that they are in fact being kept abreast of new developments.

Even with these difficulties, however, the size and scope of such programs is impressive. In the field of medicine, for example, continuing education programs recognized by the American Medical Association in 1971-72 numbered 2,354; they were offered by 798 institutions in 37 states (AMA Department, 1971). The American Medical Association recognizes practitioners who have taken part in fifty hours of continuing education activity per year over a three year period, and 24,000 members of the American Medical Association were so recognized in 1970 and 1971; with only 69 of the nation's 110 medical schools reporting, 275,000 physician registrations for continuing education programs were recorded in 1970-71 (AMA Division, 1971).

In dentistry, a similar strength can be adduced. Two of the three dental schools in the State of New York, for example, conducted 43 programs in continuing education, attended by 913 practicing dentists, in 1970-71 (Powell, 1971).

Despite the difficulties inherent in this system, therefore, its very size and geographic distribution make it a potent factor for the maintenance of professional knowledge and skill, for those practitioners who pursue it in an aggressive and knowledgeable fashion. But there is a general dissatisfaction with this basic pattern of continuing education, and several major mechanisms for improving the situation have been developed over the past several years. They are of several sorts, and examples of each kind of development will be considered as follows:

7.2. Example A - The Use of Media. There is need for geographic distribution closer to the practitioner, and a number of programs lean upon the utilization of media in order to achieve this proximity, as well as to bring about better curricular organization and increased cost-effectiveness.

Within the field of medicine, the federally-sponsored Regional Medical Programs (RMP) have placed considerable emphasis on the use of telephone networks. In Western New York, an area served by 2,500 practicing physicians, the Regional Medical Program conducts a "telephone lecture network". In 1970-71, this network produced 71 one-hour telephone lectures for physicians, distributed to 56 hospitals throughout Western New York and two counties in North Eastern Pennsylvania; there were 7,000 individual attendees at these sessions, constituting an average of three course attendances per physician. This program involves all health professions, and its overall program in 1970-71 involved a total of 182 telephone programs, with a total of 39,000 individual attendances by various health professionals.

In the field of engineering, there is utilization of a television network by the Faculty of Engineering and Applied Science at the State University of New York at Buffalo. This program provides engineers working in industries located throughout Western New York with the opportunity of intraprofessional advancement by participation in graduate instruction. At present, 87 persons in

four locations are taking graduate courses, which will allow them to receive credit towards a masters degree in engineering (Hitchcock, 1971).

7.3. Example B - Career Ladder Programs. The profession of nursing, the nursing schools and the State Education Department have united in attempting to provide a coherent pattern for intraprofessional advancement in nursing. The "career ladder" allows students to move upward through several professional levels: licensed practical nurse, registered nurse, bachelors degree in nursing, masters degree in nursing. The program for pursuing such a career ladder involves intermittent study at different institutions, and is facilitated by extensive use of the College Proficiency Examination Programs (CPEP) previously described. A leading institution in the development of this program in New York State is the School of Nursing, State University of New York at Buffalo. In 1971-72, 30 registered nurses are engaged in part-time study which will fulfil the prerequisites for the final year in the baccalaureate program and 29 are enrolled in the final year of the baccalaureate program (out of a total final year enrolment of 97). At the masters level, there are presently 77 candidates, and 61 of them have entered the program after work experience (McGrorey, 1971; Frisch, 1971).

7.4. Example C - Preceptorship Programs for Intra-Professional Advancement. In medicine and dentistry particularly, the bulk of professional practitioners work as specialists, and the pressure for youthful admissions has caused specialty training to be concentrated on youthful students. Over the last several years, a number of programs which have emerged allow practitioners to take part in one month to six month preceptorships in various specialties and sub-specialties. At the present time, one to six month preceptorships are available through a number of hospitals in New York State, in such different areas as cardiology, psychosomatic medicine, and psychiatric aspects of child care (C. Hall, 1971).

7.5. Example D - Independent Ventures. Entry of special organizations into the field of continuing education has thus far been relatively limited. In the field of law, however, an extensive continuing education program aimed at maintenance of skill is conducted by the Practicing Law Institute, a national self-supporting non-profit organization which carries out two types of programs: six session evening courses conducted in New York and two day courses conducted throughout the county. Both types of courses concentrate on currently important issues, with faculty drawn from among outstanding practitioners. Attendees pay fees ranging from $75 to $150. With attendance varying from 25 to 1,000, approximately 40-50 courses are conducted yearly (Practicing Law Institute, 1971).

7.6. Example E - Organizational Efforts Toward Coherent Patterns. There is a growing pressure from professional organizations to improve the coherence and the uniformity of continuing education programs, and to require attendance at such programs by members of the organizations. The general organizational thrust involves three distinct and mutually-supportive measures:

1. Required attendance at continuing education programs Five State Medical Societies, and one specialty society (the American Academy of General Practice) now require a specified number of hours in attendance at continuing education programs per year as a prerequisite for continued membership in the organization (AMA Division, 1971). In the State of New York, requirement for such attendance has also been built into the prerequisites for professional work with Medicaid patients, but this requirement has not yet been enforced.

2. Periodic Re-examinations. Thirteen national specialty societies are now actively engaged in producing periodic examinations aimed at determining the level of knowledge and skills of their members. These tests are voluntary at this time, and early experience has indicated that approximately 30 per cent of the membership of a national organization will take part. There is a general belief that such tests will become mandatory in the next five years. They will then provide a more definitive set of standards whereby the practitioners continued competence can be assured, and whereby he may more adequately choose those areas of continuing education which he needs to pursue (Carmichael, 1971).

3. Organization of Curricula. In an effort to bring about more uniformity in the planning of continuing education programs, national specialty societies are establishing patterns of interaction between their local branches and professional schools associated with these branches, in an effort to develop national patterns of continuing education (Carmichael, 1971). By agreement with the American Medical Association, responsibility for establishing regular cycles of this nature rests on the specialty societies. There is need for more coordination amongst specialty societies, however, and the pattern which appears to be emerging is one in which the general State Medical Societies (as in New York State) serve as coordinators, bringing together specialty societies, medical schools, regional medical programs, and state health departments into a coordinated planning and distribution effort (Bloom, 1971).

It seems necessary to continue to maintain the distinction between those programs of life-long education which are aimed at the maintenance of knowledge and skills, and those programs which are aimed at advancement within the profession. Both are essential, particularly in professions in which there is little likelihood that the pressure for youthful admissions will diminish (such as medicine and dentistry). In such a context, one can anticipate the development of a pattern of recurrent education which involves:

1. A shortened period of formal education, allowing earlier entry into practicing life.

2. Establishment of joint interdisciplinary programs given both within the framework of formal education and (on five-year cycles) within the framework of continuing education. Such cycles would be mandatory for practitioners, and would be economically feasible because of the extended span of practice life brought about by shortening the formal curriculum (Regan, 1971).

3. Extension of the principle of preceptorships lasting from one month to one year, in order to afford those who have entered practice life at an early period the opportunity to advance within specialties at their own pace and time.

4. All of these programs will depend upon more and more general acceptance of the validity of the examinations now being developed by the specialty societies.

8. THE FUTURE OF RECURRENT EDUCATION IN THE STATE OF NEW YORK

It is evident that a three-pronged thrust toward recurrent education is now in motion in the State of New York.

- In General Education, increasing numbers of programs are being designed for intermittent study and made available to both youthful and adult populations. This thrust has received strong endorsement from public bodies and private foundations.

- In Technological Education, the short-cycle institutions continue to maintain an openness and flexibility which encourages intermittent continuing study.

- In Professional Education, those fields in which there is presently an adequate number of practitioners will be able to move toward recurrent education when the picture in General Education is more compatible. In those professional areas where shortages are anticipated for the next decade, a modification of recurrent education...early but shortened formal education, mandatory cycles of recurrent education spread out over the practitioners professional life time, and options for intra-professional advancement...seems to be emerging.

9. PROBLEMS FACING RECURRENT EDUCATION

There are, nonetheless, serious obstacles to these developments. Not the least of these is the absence of a uniform terminology for describing a program of recurrent education. At this moment, as we have seen, programs which possess the elements of recurrent education are variously described as "adult", "continuing", or "part-time" education. A more rational nomenclature is an urgent need.

A second difficulty lies in the area of funding. At the present time, the State of New York is experiencing great financial difficulty in supporting the conventional educational establishment. Those elements of education which are recurrent in nature could, in fact, relieve some of the pressures on this educational establishment. Paradoxically, however, efforts in recurrent education are the ones least supported in the system; consequently, they are small, and they face an uphill struggle in attracting younger students, for whom the conventional enterprise is both cheaper and more prestigious. Until adequate financial support is directed toward recurrent education, the vicious cycle of expense and demand will continue to favor the conventional enterprises.

Thirdly, recurrent education faces the difficulty that it is beset with too many unknowns. As we have seen, the numbers of students who engage in part-time education are known only by estimates and extrapolations. Further distribution, as between age groups, sexes and socio-economic levels is also unknown. It is fortunate that this situation is in the process of clarification within the State of New York. The State Education Department has responded to its mandate for the organization and planning of education in the State of New York by embarking on a two-year study program, designed to identify and synthesize all available information regarding adult and continuing education. It has engaged the cooperation of distinguished educators from the public and private sectors of higher education in the State, and is conducting an investigation partially supported by the United States Office of Education. Within the next two years, considerable clarification of the total human and financial investment in adult education will be known, and it will be possible better to assess the proportion of that investment which is truly recurrent in nature.

A fourth difficulty is one which causes considerable concern amongst those who favor a life-long pattern of learning. It is a type of counter-thrust epitomized in the so-called "one-college" concept. In this concept, a university or college would operate from early morning until late night, with all courses open to young and old alike; special evening programs and adult programs would be abolished. Adherents of adult education recognize that the "one-college" concept could have virtue, but only if balanced sequences of courses and teaching techniques were adapted to adults. They believe, however, that implementation of a "one-college" concept would place all courses in departmental bounds, and would terminate appropriate opportunities for adults. In fact, a "one-college" proposal is now in planning stages at Brooklyn College; if present plans are not modified, the School of General Studies will be no more.

Finally, a serious difficulty confronting the development of recurrent education is the almost universal tendency to focus attention on the problems of the massive existing enterprise, rather than upon alternative solutions. In some respects, this phenomenon is reflected in reports such as those of the Carnegie Commission (1970) and the Newman Report (1971) even with their concern about life-long learning. Both of these reports pay considerable attention to the vast conventional educational establishment, and make sweeping recommendations for changes in those establishments. If their recommendations about conventional institutions are pursued, it must be anticipated that a long process of organizational friction, confusion about disciplinary and departmental

roles and financial readjustments will all be necessary. Moreover, whatever changes do take place in the conventional institutions will not necessarily lead to a shift of educational emphasis from immediate secondary school leavers to life-long education. It is to be hoped that those elements concerning recurrent education manifested in the Carnegie Commission Report and the Newman Report will receive more attention and suitable focus of the sort provided by the Regents' External Degree Program and the State University's Empire State College.

10. POLICY CONSIDERATIONS EFFECTING RECURRENT EDUCATION

Policy regarding post-secondary education in the State of New York has traditionally been achieved by consensus emerging from pluralism. Governmental intervention has largely been limited to fiscal areas, through the choice of institutions or programs that would receive taxpayer support.

In New York, it is possible for the legislative and executive branches of government to exert a strong influence on education, through the use of this fiscal power. The Board of Regents is required to submit a Master Plan for Higher Education to the Governor, at five year intervals. Into this Master Plan are incorporated proposals from institutions in both the public and private sectors (insofar as they are endorsed by the Regents) as well as proposals initiated by the Regents themselves. The Governor has the power to require modifications in this plan before approving it. Even after it is approved, however, both the Governor and the Legislature may direct funding to enterprises they favor, and deny funding to those which they consider to merit lower priority.

In many respects, this is an attractive system. The Board of Regents is a constitutional body, whose members (elected by the Legislature) serve for overlapping 15 year terms. It is not subordinate to the government in power for its authority. It is dependent on the government in power for the funds with which to exercise its authority. The system vests planning responsibility in a non-political body, with the political branches of government able to exercise discretion on the issues of action.

There are, however, two flaws in this system as it presently operates.

The first of these flaws is not inherent in the system, but is more a reflection of the speed with which changes have swept through education. Simply stated, it amounts to the fact that in the 190 year history of the Board of Regents, it is only in the last two decades that post-secondary education has become a problem, and the planning capacity of the Regents in this area is only in early developmental stages. Even the requirement for a Master Plan is less than one decade old.

As a consequence of this fact, most plans that are presented to the Governor and the Legislature have emerged from the existing public and private institutions. Predictably, the plans call for more resources to be directed to the conventional institutions and conventional programs. With the State presently faving a serious fiscal crisis, it would seem

logical that innovative and more effective programs might be given support, even at the cost of reducing support to the conventional enterprises; the fact that the conventional institutions have made no such proposals will surely occasion no surprise.

In short, the system needs bolstering by a greatly expanded planning effort focusing on major objectives, probably with relegation of detailed administration to regional bodies. Only with such planning can the Governor and Legislature be provided with truly effective sets of voices. Fortunately, this type of planning is being pursued by the Regents, and the recent innovations of the Regents and the State University (with the Regents' External Degree Program and the Empire State College) are favorable indications.

A second difficulty faced by the New York system is more inherent in the structure. The constitutional status of the Board of Regents provides education with very valuable insulation from detrimental political interference. On the other hand, it can run the risk of over-insulation. As is well recognized, a centralized organization, especially one with constitutional status, can become divorced from the wide variations of local needs and impose arbitrary uniform mandates on all. It can also become insulated from the broader social issues with which the legislature and executive branches of government must deal. The Board of Regents has managed to avoid these dangers in the past, and the general opinion appears to be that they will succeed in continuing to do so.

Regarding the specific issue of recurrent education in this policy-making context, several themes have been repeatedly expressed by many of those persons interviewed in the course of this study. Substantially, these themes are:

1. There is need for improved state-wide planning for post-secondary education.

2. Such planning should be concerned with major educational objectives, in the context of the State's general situation. Central planning should abjur minutiae.

3. Detailed execution of plans should be carried out by appropriate regional bodies with significant citizen participation.

4. Innovative ventures requiring significant departures from conventional educational practices, such as recurrent education, can best be developed by establishing new degree-granting and mission-oriented institutions, on a scale sufficiently large to insure viability.

It appears to most of those interviewed that all of these elements are necessary, if the concept of recurrent education is to be developed in a speedy fashion. Failing such a series of steps, present trends indicate that recurrent education will grow more slowly; the present growth seems steady, however, and public clamor for more flexibility may bring about a sufficient consensus that they will accelerate spontaneously.

11. SUMMARY

The State of New York is an excellent example of many of the paradoxes and problems which confront a society in which compulsory secondary education has resulted in nearly-universal completion of secondary education. As larger and larger numbers of secondary school leavers have sought entry into post-secondary education, they have, successively, filled existing conventional institutions, caused the creation of new and expanded conventional institutions, and then filled those new and expanded institutions. As financial limits have been reached (and post-secondary education costs to the State of New York alone exceed one billion dollars per year) the mounting pressures by young people for admission make it more and more difficult for adults to gain entry, and for institutions to give adequate consideration (either educationally or financially) to the needs of adults. Youthful students are forced into the system, because of their knowledge that entry at a later point is extraordinarily difficult. They thus have become captives of the "student caste" system, both resenting the long and enforced duration of their studies, and becoming increasingly dis-associated from the problems of non-campus life.

A program of recurrent education could produce striking improvements in this entire system. By this approach alone, it would be possible to ease the pressures on the conventional educational system, restructure educational programs to deal with different levels of maturity in the student body and increase opportunities for equality and educational flexibility at all stages of life.

At this moment, there are signs that such a movement is underway in the State of New York. Programs bearing the characteristics of recurrent education are now in motion in General Education, Technologic Education and Professional Education. They are, to be sure, scattered, small, and variable. They are gaining support from the most influential bodies in the State and the nation, however, and strenuous efforts are underway to shed improved light on what has previously been an unobserved area.

If these promises for the future are to become real, it is necessary for the present trends to continue and accelerate. Greater attention to the phenomenon of recurrent education can provide encouragement to present programs, and lead to that greater clarification of educational goals so essential for the success of the undertaking.

ANNEX

BIBLIOGRAPHY AND PERSONAL COMMUNICATIONS

Alvis HJ: Director of Medical Education, Millard Fillmore Hospital, Buffalo, New York. Personal Communication, 1971.

AMA Dept of Continuing Education: Continuing education courses for physicians (Sept 1, 1971--Aug 31, 1972). JAMA 217: 601-686, 1971.

AMA Division of Medical Education: Medical Education in the United States 1970--1971. JAMA 218: 1199-1286, Nov 22, 1971.

Benzel T: Director, Bachelor of Arts Degree Program for Adults, Syracuse University. Personal Communication, 1971.

Berdahl RO: Professor and Chairman, Department of Higher Education, State University of New York at Buffalo. Personal Communication, 1971.

Berner RF: Professor and Dean, Continuing Education, State University of New York at Buffalo. Personal Communication, 1971.

Berrian A: Associate Commissioner for Higher Education, New York State Education Department. Personal Communication, 1971.

Bloom ML: Initiation of Cooperative Statewide Planning to Improve Continuing Medical Education System. NY State J Med 71: 1847-1876, 1971.

Brutvan DR: Associate Professor and Associate Dean, Continuing Education, State University of New York at Buffalo. Personal Communication, 1971.

Carmichael HT, Small SM, Regan PF: Prospects and Proposals: Life Time Learning for Psychiatrists. American Psychiatric Assn, Washington, in press, 1971.

Carnegie Commission on Higher Education: Higher Education and the Nation's Health. McGraw-Hill, New York, 1970, pp128.

Carnegie Commission on Higher Education: Less Time, More Options. McGraw-Hill, New York, 1971. pp45.

Catalogue, 1971--72: The Bachelor of Arts in Liberal Studies, State University of New York College at Brockport.

Christian R: Visual Information Services. New York, New York. Personal Communication, 1971.

Clute KF: The General Practitioner: A Study of Medical Education and Practice in Cntario and Nova Scotia. Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 1963.

College Level Examination Program: College Board Review 81: 17-31, 1971.

Dryer, BV: Lifetime Learning for Physicians. J Med Educ 37, #6, part 2: 1-334, 1962.

Executive Budget for the Fiscal Year April 1, 1971 to March 31, 1972: State of New York, Executive Chamber, Feb 1, 1971.

Frey C: Engineers Joint Council. New York, New York. Personal Communication, 1971.

Frisch, EG: Assistant to the Dean, School of Nursing, State University of New York at Buffalo. Personal Communication, 1971.

Funk F: Dean, University College, Syracuse University. Personal Communication, 1971.

Gardner JW: Education as a Way of Life. Science 148: 759-761, May 7, 1965.

Gelber M: Director, University Without Walls--Skidmore College. Personal Communication, 1971.

Hall C: Director, Continuing Medical Education, School of Medicine, State University of New York at Buffalo. Personal Communication, 1971.

Hall, James: President, Empire State College. Personal Communication, 1971.

Hall, John: Director of Admissions, Empire State College. Personal Communication, 1971.

Hitchcock LB: Professor and Director, GEMS-TV, State University of New York at Buffalo. Personal Communication, 1971.

Ingall JRF: Director, Regional Medical Program of Western New York. Personal Communication, 1971.

Jacobson MS: Night and Day. The Scarecrow Press, Metuchen, 1970, pp358.

Jacobson MS, Offenbacher DI: Accent on Adults. Syracuse University Publications, Syracuse, 1970.

Johnston L: Director, Bachelor of Liberal Studies Program, State University College at Brockport. Personal Communication, 1971.

Johnstone JWC, Rivera RJ: Volunteers for Learning. Aldine, Chicago, 1965, pp624.

Joint Advisory Committee: Continuing Engineering Studies. Engineering Council for Professional Development, New York, 1965.

Kaplowitz RA: The Weekend College, Long Island University, 1971.

Lauper R: Acting Director, Continuing Education and Special Projects. C.W. Post Center, Long Island University. Personal Communication, 1971.

Lewis CE, Hassanein RS: Continuing Medical Education - An Epidemiologic Evaluation. New Eng J Med 282: 254-259, 1970.

Martorana SV: Vice Chancellor, State University of New York. Personal Communication, 1971.

McGrorey RT: Professor and Dean, School of Nursing, State University of New York at Buffalo. Personal Communication, 1971.

McKenzie B: Director, Audio-Visual Programs, Empire State College. Personal Communication, 1971.

Newman F et al: Report on Higher Education, US Govt Printing Office, Washington, 1971, pp130.

Nolan DJ: The Regents' External Degree Program in Symposium "Toward the Open University", State University of New York at Buffalo, May 1971, pp 13-20.

Nolan DJ: Director, Division of Independent Study, New York State Education Department. Personal Communication, 1971.

Palamountain J: President, Skidmore College. Personal Communication, 1971.

Powell RA: Professor and Associate Dean, School of Dentistry, State University of New York at Buffalo. Personal Communication, 1971.

Practicing Law Institute: Information Office, New York, New York.

Razik TA: Associate Professor, Curriculum Development, State University of New York at Buffalo. Personal Communication, 1971.

Regan PF, Small SM: Toward a Continuum of Formal and Continuing Education. Amer J Psychiat 128: 99-101, 1971.

Reyes-Guerra A: Engineer's Council for Professional Development, New York, New York. Personal Communication, 1971.

Reynolds JL: Coordinator, Telephone Lecture Network, Regional Medical Program of Western New York. Personal Communication, 1971.

Schwartz RP: Provost and Dean, Faculty of Law and Jurisprudence, State University of New York at Buffalo. Personal Communication, 1971.

Smith R: Dean, School of Continuing Education, New York University. Personal Communication, 1971.

Spengler E: Dean Emeritus, School of General Studies, Brooklyn College. Personal Communication, 1971.

State University of New York: 1970 Progress Report and Interim Revision of the Master Plan of 1968. State University of New York, Albany, 1970.

State University of New York, Office of Institutional Research: Part-Time Enrolment in Two-Year Colleges, Fall 1970. State University of New York, Albany, 1971.

Storey PB: Continuing Medical Education in the Soviet Union. New England J Med 285: 437-442, 1971.

US Department of Commerce, Bureau of the Census: 1970 Census of Population, US, February, 1971.

Veillette PT: Education Examiner, Division of the Budget, State of New York. Personal Communication, 1971.

Wigren H: National Educational Association, Washington, D.C. Personal Communication, 1971.

Williams R: Office of Continuing Education, New York State Education Department. Personal Communication, 1971.

Youmans JB: Experience with a Postgraduate Course for Practitioners: Evaluation of Results. J Assn Med Coll 10: 154-173, 1935.